

# [JLSD]Submission Acknowledgement

2 pesan

**Kemal Yildirim** <jlsd@openaccesspublications.org> To: basomadiong@universitasbosowa.ac.id Mon, Jul 3, 2023 at 7:25 PM

Baso Madiong,

Thank you for submitting your manuscript, "Legal Protection of Indigenous Peoples Over Natural Resources and Paradigm Shift of Traditional and Modern Values in South Sulawesi, Indonesia" to Journal of Law and Sustainable Development. With the online journal management system we use, you will be able to track its progress through theeditorial process by logging into the journal's website:

Manuscript URL: https://ojs.journalsdg.org/jlss/authorDashboard/submission/458

Username: madiong\_baso

If you have any questions, please contact me. Thank you for considering this journal as your workplace.

**Editorial Board** 

Journal of Law and Sustainable Development.

https://ojs.journalsdg.org/jlss

**Baso Madiong** <a href="mailto:basomadiong@universitasbosowa.ac.id">basomadiong@universitasbosowa.ac.id</a>
To: Kemal Yildirim <a href="mailto:sjlsd@openaccesspublications.org">jlsd@openaccesspublications.org</a>

Mon, Jul 3, 2023 at 7:58 PM

Dear Editor,

Thank you for the response to our manuscript submission entitled, "Legal Protection of Indigenous Peoples Over Natural Resources and Paradigm Shift of Traditional and Modern Values In South Sulawesi, Indonesia" to be published in the Journal of Law And Sustainable Development. We hope that our manuscript can be processed as soon as possible.

Best Regards, Baso Madiong Correspondence

[Kutipan teks disembunyikan]



## [JLSD] Round 1 Reviewer 2 Report

3 pesan

Kemal Yildirim <jlsd@openaccesspublications.org> To: basomadiong@universitasbosowa.ac.id Thu, Jul 13, 2023 at 7:01 PM

Dear Author

Your article entitled: Legal Protection of Indigenous Peoples Over Natural Resources and Paradigm Shift Of Traditional and Modern Values in South Sulawesi, Indonesia.

We recommend that the following details be observed in your paper:

- The abstract should be in a structured mode, like any other article published in a journal.
- The article should certainly be divided into: 1. introduction (in running text, without subheadings, presenting contextualisation, research objectives or questions and justification), 2. theoretical framework, 3. methodology, 4. results and discussion, 5. conclusion.
- We ask that you cite at least 2 papers published in the Journal of Social and Environmental Management <a href="https://rgsa.emnuvens.com.br">https://rgsa.emnuvens.com.br</a>/ or in the Journal of Law and Sustainable Development <a href="https://www.journalsdg.">https://www.journalsdg.</a> org/jlss (journals belonging to Open Access Publications).

If you have any questions, please contact me. Thank you for considering this journal as your workplace.

**Editorial Board** 

Journal of Law and Sustainable Development.

https://ojs.journalsdg.org/jlss

Thu, Jul 13, 2023 at 7:38 PM

## **Dear Editor-in-Chief**

Thank you for the information, we will immediately revise our article with the corrections from the reviewer. We will then resubmit the revised manuscript.

Best regards,

**Baso Madiong** 

Correspondence

[Kutipan teks disembunyikan]

**Baso Madiong** <a href="mailto:basomadiong@universitasbosowa.ac.id">basomadiong@universitasbosowa.ac.id</a>
To: Kemal Yildirim <a href="mailto:sjlsd@openaccesspublications.org">jlsd@openaccesspublications.org</a>

Sun, Jul 16, 2023 at 6:57 PM

#### Dear Editor-in-Chief

Our article entitled: Legal Protection of Indigenous Peoples Over Natural Resources and Paradigm Shift Of Traditional and Modern Values in South Sulawesi, Indonesia.

We have improved according to the suggestions of the reviewer on our paper:

- The abstract has been structured according to the template.

- The structure of the article has been adjusted according to the reviewer's suggestions which consist of: 1. Introduction (page 1) in running text, without subtitle, (page 1) and has presented contextualisation, objectives or research questions and justification), 2. Methodology (page 6), 3. Results and Discussion (page 7), 5. Conclusion (page 13).
- We have corrected and cited 2 papers published in Journal of Social and in Journal of Law and Sustainable Development - https://www.journalsdq. org/jlss (journals belonging to Open Access Publications). (page 15)

In the substance and revisions we made, we added several theoretical studies according to the reviewer's suggestions and input (introduction, conceptual framework, and results sections) related to supporting theories. Among them are our citations from:

Agustinus, L, J., Samekto, F. X. A., Ispriyarso, B. (2023). Towards a Fairer Future: Examining Environmental Permits in Indonesia and Sweden Through the Lens of Sustainable Development and Equity. JOURNAL OF LAW AND SUSTAINABLE DEVELOPMENT. v.11, n. 2 pages: 01-29 e0284 2023

Mappong, Z., Lili (2023). Right to Self Submission to Western Inheritance Law for the Heirs Of Islamic Religion Whom the Property Leaver Has Different Religion. JOURNAL OF LAW AND SUSTAINABLE DEVELOPMENT v.11, n. 2 pages: 01-28 | e0423 | 2023

Best regards, **Baso Madiong** Correspondence [Kutipan teks disembunyikan]

Revised-Article-Baso Madiong (Results of revision-1-Reviewer-2).docx 99K



# [JLSD]Round 2 Reviewer 1 Report

2 pesan

Kemal Yildirim <jlsd@openaccesspublications.org> To: basomadiong@universitasbosowa.ac.id Fri, Jul 14, 2023 at 7:25 PM

Dear Author,

Your manuscript entitled "Legal Protection of Indigenous Peoples Over Natural Resources and Paradigm Shift of Traditional and Modern Values in South Sulawesi, Indonesia" discusses the forms of state recognition of indigenous peoples and the paradigm shift of traditional to modern indigenous values. This paper presents interesting case study research.

This manuscript has some issues that need to be addressed in order to be published. Below are some recommendations that I hope will help the author.

#### Introduction

As written now, it is difficult to follow the main message of the introduction. The authors conflate ideas regarding the concept of legal protection of customary law communities according to the 1945 Constitution of the Republic of Indonesia. I suggest separating the ideas by focusing each paragraph on one idea. In addition, it will create a flow and explain the traditional indigenous people to make changes along with the development of the country.

#### Methods

Please add the data source and reference year for each dataset used in this research.

Qualitative research methods are used to build knowledge through understanding and finding.

Considering that this qualitative research aims to understand and interpret various phenomena that exist or occur in reality as a characteristic of qualitative research, in this case, what factors influence state recognition of indigenous peoples and the paradigm shift of traditional customary values to modern customs.

#### Research Results and Discussion

First of all, the results section contains only the results of the analyses conducted by the authors. Therefore, I strongly recommend removing any information from other studies.

Secondly, table 1, which contains the recognition of Customary Law Areas of South Sulawesi Province, should be simplified and summarised without reducing its substance.

Thirdly, the results section is very long which is related to state recognition of customary law. I suggest keeping only the most important information that answers the formulated research questions. I suggest rewording this section to present the data collected and analysed.

Figure 1 is not readable.

Overall, I recommend shortening the list of citations. Use the ones that are most important and relevant to your study.

If you have any questions, please contact me. Thank you for considering this journal as your workplace.

**Editorial Board** 

\_\_Journal of Law and Sustainable Development.

https://ojs.journalsdg.org/jlss

Sun, Jul 16, 2023 at 6:59 PM

Dear Reviewer,

We would like to thank you for the feedback provided by the reviewer. Here we present the revisions we have made regarding our article.

In the introduction, we have restructured the discussion on indigenous peoples as autonomous customary communities and state recognition of customary law, the concept of legal protection of indigenous peoples, the characteristics of traditional indigenous peoples, and the development of the process of recognition and protection of indigenous peoples in South Sulawesi (pages 1-3).

In the methodology section, we have added data sources and reference years used in this research (page 6).

We have revised and corrected the structure of the discussion of research results. We have eliminated other irrelevant studies and focused more on data and research results in accordance with the research questions posed. table 1 which contains the recognition of the Customary Law Region of South Sulawesi Province has been simplified and summarised without reducing its substance (page 7).

In the results and discussion section, we have revised the substance related to state recognition of customary law, and have rearranged the sections that present the data collected and analysed (pages 10-11).

Figure 1 has been revised to read more clearly (page 7).

Overall, revisions have been made by shortening the list of citations, and keeping the most important and relevant to our study.

Best Regards,
Baso Madiong
Correspondence
[Kutipan teks disembunyikan]



Baso Madiong Article (revision result-2-Reviewer-1).docx 127 K



## [JLSD] Round 2 Reviewer 2 Report

3 pesan

Kemal Yildirim <jlsd@openaccesspublications.org> To: basomadiong@universitasbosowa.ac.id Tue, Juli 25, 2023 at 8:25 PM

Dear Author,

Best regards from The Advanced Institute of Higher Education of Barreiras (IAESB). Thank you very much for submitting your manuscript to JOURNAL OF LAW AND SUSTAINABLE DEVELOPMENT.

Your paper has been reviewed by 2 independent experts. After considering the reviews, we have reached a decision regarding your submission. Our decision is: Revision Required.

The reviewers recommend you: The topic is interesting and important. However, there are some key areas that require more improvement.

#### Reviewers:

- 1 In the Abstract section, please highlight the purpose and novelty of this particular research.
- 2 Authors should explain the academic contribution of the developed work (50-150-word conclusion).

Highlight what is innovative/ original from the existing literature.

3 - In the "Conclusion" section, you should explain the limitations of the research as well as the research perspective in the conclusion.

Please consider the reviewers' comments, and revise as soon as possible. Deadline for submission of revised article and payment: 3 August 2023. Articles will be published until 3 October 2023.

If you have any questions, please contact me. Thank you for considering this journal as your workplace.

**Editorial Board** 

Journal of Law and Sustainable Development.

https://ojs.journalsdg.org/jlss

**Baso Madiong** <a href="mailto:basomadiong@universitasbosowa.ac.id">basomadiong@universitasbosowa.ac.id</a>
To: Kemal Yildirim <a href="mailto:list@openaccesspublications.org">list@openaccesspublications.org</a>

Tue, Juli 25, 2023 at 8:37 PM

Dear Editor-in-Chief

Thank you for the information, we will immediately revise our article with corrections from the reviewer and will immediately make payment. Furthermore, we will send back the revised manuscript.

Best Regards,

**Baso Madiong** 

Correspondence

[Kutipan teks disembunyikan]

Fri, Jul 28, 2023 at 6:25 PM

#### Dear Editor-in-Chief

Regards from us. Thank you very much for being willing to correct our article to be published in the journal: JOURNAL OF LAW AND SUSTAINABLE DEVELOPMENT

The improvements based on the recommendations of the editor have been made on:

- 1. The Abstract section has been sharpened regarding the research objectives and the novelty value has been described in the abstract. The novelty value is the state's recognition of indigenous peoples and the paradigm shift of traditional customary values to modern customary values.
- 2. an academic contribution has been made from the work developed where the results of this research provide insight into the development of customary law towards modern indigenous peoples.
- 3. in the conclusion section, we have corrected it by providing or explaining the research limitations, namely on the pattern of paradigm shift of traditional customary law values to modern customary law societies; research perspective, namely discussed related to the equal rights of indigenous peoples in technological development.

Furthermore, we send the improved article manuscript.

Best Regards, **Baso Madiong** Correspondence [Kutipan teks disembunyikan]



Baso Madiong Article (Round 2 Reviewer 2).docx 98K



## [JLSD]Round 3 Reviewer 1 Report

2 pesan

Kemal Yildirim <jlsd@openaccesspublications.org> To: basomadiong@universitasbosowa.ac.id Wed, Jul 26, 2023 at 8:15 PM

Dear Author,

This manuscript discusses Indigenous Peoples' Legal Protection of Nature Shifting Resources and Traditional and Modern Paradigms. The research objectives are well defined and the approach is well reasoned. The manuscript has been written following our suggestions. However, it still needs to be sharpened in the results and discussion section related to the legal protection of indigenous peoples over natural resource shifts and traditional and modern paradigms. we suggest that in the results and discussion section, it can be explained about legal protection and state recognition of indigenous peoples and the paradigm of traditional community values in modern indigenous peoples.

If you have any questions, please contact me. Thank you for considering this journal as your workplace.

**Editorial Board** 

Journal of Law and Sustainable Development.

https://ojs.journalsdg.org/jlss

**Baso Madiong** <a href="mailto:basomadiong@universitasbosowa.ac.id">basomadiong@universitasbosowa.ac.id</a>
To: Kemal Yildirim <a href="mailto:jlsd@openaccesspublications.org">jlsd@openaccesspublications.org</a>

Sun, Jul 30, 2023 at 7:15 PM

Dear reviewer,

Thank you for the feedback and suggestions given to us. We have substantially improved and revised several things, according to the reviewer's suggestions, as follows:

In the results and discussion section we have revised in accordance with the suggestions of the editor. In the results and discussion section, we divided it into two discussions. The first discussion is on legal protection and state recognition of indigenous peoples, the substance of which discusses the recognition and protection of the rights of indigenous peoples to be important, to obtain legal protection of their rights in the management of natural resources contained therein through normative requirements in legislation. The inhibiting factors are related to the local political situation and the local government's half-hearted willingness to recognise indigenous peoples, the wrong perspective on indigenous peoples, financial support from the government, in this case the Ministry of Home Affairs, and power relations. In the second section, it is argued that values in society are always evolving, so the interaction of customary law with written law will always occur. Traditional customary law values and modern legal values require harmony. As a living law, customary law always undergoes changes or shifts in the pattern of community life (pages 7-13).

Best Regards,
Baso Madiong
Correspondence
[Kutipan teks disembunyikan]



Baso Madiong Article (revision results-3-Reviewer-1.docx 106K



# [JLSD] Round 3 Reviewer 2 Report

2 pesan

Kemal Yildirim <jlsd@openaccesspublications.org> To: basomadiong@universitasbosowa.ac.id Fri, Sep 8, 2023 at 7:25 PM

Dear Author,

We inform you that after evaluation by our external referees, your article submitted to the Journal of Law and Sustainable Development (e-ISSN: 2764-4170) has been ACCEPTED.

To continue the publication process, you need to fulfil the external reviewers' requests and submit a new file containing author data and suggested changes.

At the same time, a publication fee of U\$800 must be paid, as described on our website (https://ojs.journalsdg.org/jlss/editorialpolicies).

This amount can be paid via deposit and credit card (Paypal). If you prefer to pay by deposit, please use the information below:

Open Access Publications Ltda. Beneficiary bank: BB Americas Bank

Benefeciary Bank Address: 1221 Brickell Avenue, Suite 2200, Miami, Florida 33131

Business checking account number: 1000260651

SWIFT code: BRASUS3AXXX Routing Number/ ABA 067012688

If you would rather pay by credit card, please let us know so we can send you a link to paypal.

We need you to send us the sources from every table, chart, figures.

After payment, only one of the authors must be responsible for sending the receipt, the authors' data and the new WORD file with the changes. The deadline for publication is 10 bussines days after sending the receipt and the updated article.

Best regards Editorial team Journal of Law and Sustainable Development

If you have any questions, please contact me. Thank you for considering this journal as your workplace. Editorial Board

Journal of Law and Sustainable Development.

https://ojs.journalsdg.org/jlss

**Baso Madiong** <a href="mailto:basomadiong@universitasbosowa.ac.id">basomadiong@universitasbosowa.ac.id</a>
To: Kemal Yildirim <a href="mailto:list@openaccesspublications.org">list@openaccesspublications.org</a>

Mon, Sep 11, 2023 at 8:39 PM

Dear Editor,

Thank you for accepting our manuscript entitled: LEGAL PROTECTION OF COMMUNITIES OVER NATURAL RESOURCESAND THE SHIFTING PARADIGMA OF TRADITIONAL AND MODERN VALUES IN SOUTH SULAWESI, INDONESIA and wehave made payment in accordance with the instructions and explanations on the journal website (https://ojs.journalsdg.org/jlss/editorialpolicies).

We hereby send the corrected result and proof of payment of U\$800.

Best Regards, **Baso Madiong** Correspondence [Kutipan teks disembunyikan]

## 3 lampiran



Payment Receipt-1.jpeg 92K



Payment Receipt-1.jpeg 305K

**Baso Madiong-Author Data and Suggested Changes.docx** 207K